

Memorandum

TO: Honorable Mayor and City Council

FROM: Natalie Lewis and Brent Stockwell, Assts. to the Mayor and Council

DATE: October 26, 2004

RE: City Council Subcommittee Overview

Based on City Council interest to assess the use of subcommittees, staff has contacted other Valley cities to learn about their subcommittee structures, purpose and public involvement opportunities. The Arizona cities contacted included: Chandler, Gilbert, Glendale, Mesa, Peoria, Phoenix, and Tempe. Examples about the types of items reviewed by the subcommittees and copies of most recent agendas and minutes are available upon request. Also provided is an historical synopsis of the former and existing subcommittees in Scottsdale.

Some of the common trends/findings discovered include:

- Generally, the purpose of the Council subcommittees is to: a) review and make recommendations on items that will eventually be brought forward to the full city council for final review/action; and/or b) to provide staff briefings/updates on items of interest, i.e. similar to the informal updates Scottsdale staff provides to the Council today in the form of white papers and meetings.
- Most Council subcommittees meet only on an as needed basis, except for the City of Phoenix, which has a more formal system.
- Public comment at the subcommittee level is typically listed on the agenda; but most Valley cities report that there is little or no public attendance at these meetings.

If you have questions or need clarification on this information, please feel free to contact either Natalie Lewis or Brent Stockwell at 480-312-2422. Thank you.

City Council Subcommittees Report

Chandler, Arizona

Chandler currently has four Council subcommittees that are established informally, i.e not required by code or charter. The Mayor makes appointments every two years. Their purpose/charge is to serve as a "pre-briefing" forum (i.e. provide input/feedback to staff) for an item that will eventually go to City Council for action. Subcommittees meet on an "as needed" basis, e.g. items will come forward for subcommittee review if members make a request or if staff identifies a need such as review of a draft report, etc. Subcommittee meetings are publicly posted and there is time set aside for citizen comments. However, citizen and media interest and attendance is reported to be minimal; and the citizen comment period is rarely used.

Public Safety Council Subcommittee (police and fire)	 The last meeting was August 16, 2004 and focused on fire-related items. An example subcommittee item was a discussion about city-related requirements of the International Fire Code. This item was discussed first by the subcommittee before presenting any proposed policy changes to the Council for action.
Communications and Public Affairs, Information Technology and Management Services Subcommittee.	 The last meeting was August 30, 2004 and focused on Management Services items. An example subcommittee item was an update on 2004-05 budget revenues and expenditures. This update was provided prior to the budget briefings before the Council.
Community Services, Economic Development and Planning and Development Subcommittee.	 This subcommittee last met on September 17, 2004. The meeting was focused on Community Service items. An example subcommittee item was a "Bark Park" Ordinance. The City is considering an ordinance limiting the age of children who are able to be in a dog park without an adult. Parks and Recreation Board is reviewing this and developing a recommendation. The Council Subcommittee is being kept informed of the progress being made by the Parks and Recreation Board.
Municipal Utilities and Public Works subcommittee	 This subcommittee last met on October 25, 2004. The meeting was focused on Public works items. An example subcommittee item was the Integrated Water/Wastewater Master Plans. The subcommittee was provided two staff briefings on these plans before Council action.

Gilbert, Arizona

While there are no standing Town Council subcommittees, in 2003 Gilbert created three <u>ad-hoc</u> council committees for: Fire, Police and Parks and Recreation. The purpose of these ad-hoc committees was to identify minimum service standards and to report those findings to the full Council for consideration during the budget process. These ad-hoc committees served for approximately 4.5 months. Committee members included three Town Council members (selected by a vote of the council), the Town Manager and Department Heads for each area. The staff members were considered equal members of the subcommittees. Committee meetings were conducted during the week, typically at 4 p.m. Meetings were posted and open to the public; very few citizens attended.

Gilbert (Cont.)	Committee met three times during the 4.5 months.
Ad-hoc Fire Subcommittee	No members of the public attended any meetings.
	• Outcome: Based on information presented by the Fire Chief and additional research requested by Committee, a Fire Committee report was created by the Town Manager to outline fire service standards, deficiencies and to forecast five-year financial resources in order to close service-related gaps.
Ad-hoc Police Subcommittee	Committee met two times during the 4.5 months.
	Only a few members of the public attended the meetings.
	Outcome: Town Manager and Police Chief prepared a report to outline minimum police/public safety service standards as insight for Council during the budget process.
Ad-hoc Parks and Recreation	Committee met two times during the 4.5 months.
Subcommittee	No members of the public attended the meetings.
	Outcome: Town Manager and Parks and Recreation Department Head prepared a report to outline minimum parks and recreation service standards that was used by Council during the budget process.

Glendale, Arizona

Glendale has one standing Council committee (in place for last five years) that is responsible for reviewing applications to the city's 18 boards and commissions and one ad-hoc committee (in place for the last year) that is focused on property maintenance code recommendations. Neither of these committees is required by code or charter. Three members serve on each committee and are appointed by the Mayor. Both subcommittees meet approximately once per month. Generally, staff develops the agendas and sets meeting dates, though Council members make requests for agenda items as well. All Committee meetings are posted, but no one from the public attends. Committee meetings are conducted during the day on weekdays. Meetings are not televised. And there is no public comment item on the agendas.

Government Services Committee	Purpose is to provide a more detailed level of review for applicants nominated by City Council members for Boards and Commissions.
	• Each District Council Member makes a recommendation for nominating one citizen from his/her district for each of the city's 18 boards and commissions. The committee meets in executive session to review these Council nominations. If the committee doesn't know the applicant, they have the option of inviting the applicant in for an interview. The committee makes recommendations that the full Council reviews first at a work study session and then takes final action at a formal meeting.
Property Code Maintenance Subcommittee	Based on continued complaints about property code maintenance issues, the Mayor formed this ad hoc subcommittee in 2003 and appointed three council members with the most code problems in their districts. The committee meets monthly to review property maintenance issues and related codes, including historic preservation.
	• This committee is currently in the process of making recommendations to update the history preservation code. These recommendations will go to the full Council for consideration.

Mesa, Arizona

Mesa has six Council subcommittees that are required by City Code. They meet quarterly but only when there are multiple items to discuss. The City Manager or his senior managers develop agendas and set meetings. Each Council Member is asked by the Mayor to chair one subcommittee and to serve on two others. The Mayor makes appointments every two years. The purpose of the Mesa Council subcommittees is to provide a less formal atmosphere for staff-to-council dialogues, for subcommittee members to analyze various items before those decisions go before the Council. The public is invited to observe subcommittee sessions; Subcommittee meetings are similar to work study sessions, but not televised. Items with significant council or community interest do not go to subcommittees—they automatically go to full council. For example, the decision of whether or not to form a civilian review board for police shootings went directly to City Council hearing. The more typical "path" an item takes from the committees to Council: 1) committees review (not televised; public observes; meetings held during the day); 2) committee recommendation goes to full council at a Work Study Session (televised; public observes; meetings on Thursday mornings or at 4 p.m. prior to Monday CC meetings); and then 3) the item is acted on formally by full council at a regular hearing (televised; public may provide testimony; meetings on 1st and 3rd Monday evenings). Most items taking this "path" are passed on consent.

Police Committee	 The last meeting of the Mesa Police Committee was on August 30, 2004. One item discussed was about the planned acquisition of new Glock revolvers for all Police personnel. The older handguns were being replaced by the manufacturer at a cost that made sense for the City but at a price above the City Manager's spending authority. This item was discussed by the committee, went to full Council at a Work Study Session and then was passed on consent at a formal Council meeting.
Fire Committee	 The last meeting of the Mesa Fire Committee was on May 17, 2004. An item discussed related to changes in how Mesa contracts for ambulance services. The changes were presented by staff and discussed by the committee, went to full Council at a work study session, and eventually was acted on by the full Council at a public hearing.
General Development Committee	 This committee is involved in development-related issues; and is the one committee that meets more often than the others – generally on a monthly basis. The City also has citizen-appointed Design Review Board and a Planning and Zoning Commission that also make recommendations on development issues. As such, the committee only gets involved when there are city code amendments or reductions or improvements in services provided. An example of an item heard by the committee was proposed updates to the Mesa Desert Uplands ordinance (similar to ESLO in Scottsdale). This item went back and forth between the General Development Council Committee and the Planning and Zoning Citizen Commission until all were satisfied with the new changes. Thereafter the issue went to the full Council at Work Study Session and then for final action at a public hearing.

City of Mesa (Cont.) Transportation Committee	 The last time this committee met was on July 8, 2004. At that meeting, the committee discussed possible changes to their in-lieu street payment policy. In Mesa, all developers have to help pay for a portion of the street construction that is adjacent to their property. The Transportation Committee recommended an ordinance update to create "an equitable alternative" for the smaller residential and commercial developments regarding the standard public works improvement requirements. This item went to the full Council for review at a study session and then was passed on consent at a public hearing.
Utility Committee	 This committee last met on June 3, 2004. An example of an issue that the Utility Committee discussed was a pilot program to convert alley solid waste service to curbside service due to significant cost saving opportunities. This item had lots of staff/Council discussion at the committee level, went to the full Council in Work Study Session, then went to a public hearing where there was public comment. The item passed 4-3.
Finance Committee	 The Finance Committee met several times during the budget preparation in March, April and May 2004. The committee reviews the draft budget and holds public hearings before the budget is reviewed by the full Council. This Committee also met in December 2003 to review the "Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for fiscal year ending June 30, 2003.

Peoria, Arizona

Peoria has five council subcommittees, two ad hoc and three standing. They are not required by code or charter. There are three council members on each subcommittee, all appointed by the Mayor. Their purpose is to provide in-depth review in their specific subject area and to make recommendations to the full Council. Note: Peoria did have a Public Safety Subcommittee that dealt primarily with budget priorities and staff needs for the police and fire departments. But that committee was disbanded after two years when the Council transferred this organizational responsibility back to the City Manager.

Boards and Commissions Subcommittee	Purpose is to select and recommend the appointment of citizens to various boards and commissions. By Code, the Mayor technically makes Board and Commission nominations, but has chosen to delegate the review and nomination process to this subcommittee.
	• The subcommittee tries to make appointments representative of the entire community. There has been a focus on appointing the highest quality applicants. Generally, this committee meets monthly.
Ethics Subcommittee	After an ethical issue of one of their Council Members in the early 1990's, the Mayor formed this subcommittee to develop ethical standards of behavior for City of Peoria officials and staff. Mayor appoints two members of the Council plus himself or the vice Mayor every year.
	However, this committee only meets if there is an ethical violation or investigation of one of the Council members. It hasn't met since it was formed.

Peoria (Cont.) Not-for-Profit Subcommittee	Similar to the purpose of Scottsdale's Human Services Commission, this Council subcommittee reviews and awards grants to non-profit entities. The subcommittee reviews applications and proposals from non-profits and makes recommendations to the full Council on how to allocate available human service funding. They also review and make recommendations on the CDBG (Community Development Block Grant) programs that are supported by this funding, i.e. Section 8 housing, voucher programs, etc. The Committee meets annually Feb March.
Ad Hoc Special election and Transportation Sales Tax Subcommittee	• This subcommittee was newly convened in September 2004 to review pending and potential local ballot measures on transportation sales taxes and to decide whether or not a special election is required. Thus far, it appears that the committee will meet monthly and as needed to complete this task. The subcommittee is studying the city's capital needs for transportation projects and will make a recommendation to the full council as to whether or not the Council should forward a question(s) to voters.
Ad Hoc Development Impact Fee Subcommitee	Every two years, this subcommittee convenes to study any proposed changes to the development impact fees, seek community and stakeholder feedback and comment and to make a recommendation to the full Council for action during the budget process. The committee meets monthly in the spring every two years to complete this work.

Phoenix, Arizona

The City of Phoenix currently has eight standing subcommittees and one ad-hoc committee -- each with four City Council members. Per Charter, the Mayor has sole authority to appoint subcommittees and its members. Staff support is extensive and subcommittee agendas are detailed. It appears that subcommittees serve as far more than preliminary sounding boards for actions that will go to the full Council. The majority of Council-related work and discussion tends to occur at subcommittees with full Council action mostly being a formality. About 90 percent of items forwarded from subcommittees are passed 9-0 on consent. Also, subcommittees allow council members to step out of their district-only roles. Public comment is offered at every meeting. If members of the public or media are present, the city has a call to the public for each item on the agenda.

Ad-Hoc Central City Planning Subcommittee	 This ad-hoc committee meets twice per month (2nd and 4th Thursdays at 10 a.m.) and is managed by an Asst. City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, the subcommittee reviews and provides direction related to downtown planning and strategy, e.g. partnerships for libraries, and updates on the bioscience campus.
Downtown, Sports and International	 This committee meets once per month (4th Weds. At 10 a.m.) and is managed by an Asst. City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on economic development and tourism-related efforts in downtown, e.g. review of the Civic Plaza Expansion Project, recommending participation in the P.F. Chang's Marathon, or reviewing ordinance updates that govern rates for their convention center.
Environment and Land Use	 This committee meets twice per month (1st and 3rd Thursday at 10 a.m.) and is managed by an Asst. City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on parks and recreation programs, e.g. capital improvement projects as well as preservation/state land reform or other environmental items such as tree planting programs to combat urban heat.

Phoenix (Cont.) Housing, Neighborhood Economic Revitalization, and Historic Preservation	 This subcommittee meets twice per month (1st and 3rd Weds. At 9:30 a.m.) and is managed by a Deputy City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on housing, neighborhood and historic-related items, e.g. Community Development Block Grant applications, requests for Industrial Development Authority grants for revitalization proposals, historic preservation items, code enforcement updates.
Knowledge Economy, Education, Arts and Culture	 This subcommittee meets once per month (2nd Weds. At 10 a.m.) and is managed by an Executive Assistant to the City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on library-related reading and educational programming, e.g. venture capital programming, arts and cultural programs, academic components of after-school programs, efforts to attract hi-tech businesses to Phoenix/Arizona.
Natural Resources	 This subcommittee meets once per month (2nd Thurs. at 10 a.m.) and is managed by a Deputy City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on water supply/quality, wastewater and solid waste/landfill programs, e.g. financial planning and services, storm water management items, water conservation, dust control, growing smarter act and its impact to providing infrastructure, and green building technology.
Public Safety (police, fire and judicial)	 This subcommittee meets twice per month (1st and 3rd Tues. at 10 a.m.) and is managed by a Deputy City manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on police, fire and judicial-related service enhancements, e.g. grants, crime prevention programs, fire station locations, software upgrades, updated ordinances, judicial appointments, and homeland security.
Technology and Government Efficiency	 This subcommittee meets once per month (4th Tues. at 10 a.m.) and is managed by a Deputy City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on technology and other city program/process improvements, updates (such as E-Privacy Policy), agreements with outside providers (such as Qwest, Cox, SRP, APS), or new programs to improve customer service such as 3-1-1 central telephone customer service number for non-emergency city requests.
Transportation	 This subcommittee meets once per month (2nd Weds. At 12:30 p.m. and is managed by an Exec. Asst. to the City Manager. Based on reviewing upcoming agendas, this subcommittee reviews and provides direction on transportation and transit-related services, e.g. light rail transit business assistance and outreach, accessible housing, use of radar trailers, smart parking meters, proposed Sky Harbor Connector.

Tempe, Arizona

Tempe has eight standing City Council subcommittees, with two Council Members assigned to each one. It appears that most of their committees have been inactive during the recent election cycle. They are just beginning to form and meet again. The Mayor appoints committee members following elections. Committees meet on an "as needed" basis. In Tempe, the Committees try to meet in the evenings in order to be more accessible to the public. Lead staff is assigned to each committee and handles meeting logistics and development of a proposed agenda. The Committee Members review the proposed agenda and also can make requests for items they want to hear/discuss. The purpose of the committees is to discuss items that will eventually come before the full Council, but that also require indepth analysis and public involvement before City Council action. Citizens are invited to attend and comment; but there are typically few citizens who attend.

Neighborhoods and Public Safety	 This committee met first on Oct. 12, 2004. This committee addresses neighborhood deterioration and public safety, including code enforcement, neigh. policing, redevelopment and enhancement of neighborhood-supportive business districts. Committee's work plan includes review of sign ordinance for residential districts, neigh. areas, development of ASU-City partnerships to improve public safety and student housing at ASU and within the City.
Educational Partnerships	 Committee schedule— not yet determined. The committee was created to address partnership opportunities for the City and education providers to assist in the improvement of neighborhood schools through sharing of resources, joint planning or transportation solution, and also to facilitate ASU's participation in education improvement in all Tempe schools. An example discussion item this committee reviewed (and that was eventually approved by the full Council) was regarding North Tempe Multi-Generational Center.
Community Services	 Committee schedule— not yet determined. The committee was created to address delivery of community services, reviewing capital project investments (such as the new Arts Center), identifying programs for enhancement, stabilizing golf revenues and expenses, recommending park improvements and/or rehabilitations.

Tempe (Cont.) Transportation	 Committee schedule— not yet determined. The committee was created to address development of transportation resources, including street and alley maintenance, traffic congestion, noise reduction, bus service improvements, bicycle program and development of light rail.
Diversity and Human Relations	 Committee schedule— not yet determined. This committee provides recommendations in developing and implementing diversity and anti-discrimination programs. They also review employment-related issues requiring full Council reviews because of budgetary impacts, i.e. COLA adjustments, range adjustment programs, employee housing assistance.
Technology Advancement and Redevelopment	 Committee schedule—not yet determined. This committee was created to address economic stabilization and revitalization, including ASU-City partnership for development of hightech, bio-tech, nano-tech metropolis, and the development of major employment bases and tourism-related revenues, as well as youth and amateur sports and outdoor, active tourism.
Central City Development (committee of the whole)	 Committee schedule—not yet determined. The mission of this committee is to allow time for all seven Council members (i.e. committee of the whole) to deliberate and analyze key items related to downtown vitality and economic development. An example discussion items this committee will review includes the Rio Salado and Papago Salado regional efforts.
Ad-hoc Budget and Finance	 Committee schedule—not yet determined. This committee last met during the Spring 2004, during budget preparation. The mission of this committee is to gather public input regarding the city budget and to make recommendations to the full Council.

<u>Scottsdale – Existing and Former Subcommittees</u>

Scottsdale City Code Sec. 2-23 addresses the issue of council "Committees." The city council may appoint such committees of the council as may be deemed reasonably necessary to the effective and efficient operation of the council. Members of committees shall be appointed by the mayor, with the approval of the city council, and they shall serve at the pleasure of the council."

All subcommittee meetings are open to the public and include public comment opportunities. Citizen and media attendance is dependent on items being discussed. The TPC/WestWorld/Stadium Subcommittee typically has 5-15 observers primarily consisting of representatives of user groups. The Subcommittee on Regional Aviation Issues has members of the public in attendance, as well as media presence dependent on items being discussed. The City Council Budget Subcommittee had very limited citizen attendance at their meetings. The print media covered each of their departmental budget hearings, as well as citizen forums.

Audit Committee (originally formed on 6/30/86)

- The Audit Committee met twice in FY 2003-04. The last meeting was held March 2, 2004. In the recent past, the subcommittee has met between two and four times per year.
- Scottsdale City Code Sec. 2-118 states "an audit committee is hereby established to consult with the city auditor regarding technical items, to work to assure maximum coordination between the work of the city auditor and the needs of the city manager, the other charter officers and to perform other duties as required or directed by the city council."
- This committee's structure and membership has evolved over time.
 - o In 1986, it was referred to as the "Finance/Audit Subcommittee" and was responsible for reviewing the city's financial and auditing procedures and programs.
 - o In 1989, the subcommittee was added to Code and renamed the Audit/Finance Committee. This committee included three council members and was also allowed to appoint two representatives from non-governmental industries to be non-voting members.
 - o In 1990, the committee and code were updated and referred to the body as the "audit committee," but membership consisted of the council as a whole with the Mayor as chair.
 - o In 1992, the committee was changed again into its current configuration of three members of the city council.

(Scotts. Cont.) City Council / Scottsdale School Board Joint Committee (Originally formed on 6/30/86)

- This subcommittee last met on January 16, 2003.
- The subcommittee is responsible for working with Scottsdale School District officials on matters of mutual interest and to provide opportunities for closer cooperation between city and School District officials, resulting in improved services to city residents and students.
- Examples of items this subcommittee reviews include, expediting construction
 of Thompson Peak Parkway to enhance travel from McDowell Mnt. Ranch
 area to Copper Canyon Elementary School, reviewing Intergovernmental
 Agreement between the City and School district related to shared facilities and
 programming, updating ordinance to ensure early school review of
 proposed/planned residential communities.

TPC, WestWorld, Stadium Oversight Committee (Originally formed in 1987)

- This committee typically meets on the 3rd Thursday at 8:00 a.m. in Monterra at WestWorld. The last meeting was held on May 21, 2004.
- The committee provides City Council oversight to three of the City's facilities: Scottsdale Stadium, WestWorld, and the Tournament Players Club Scottsdale (TPC).
 - o In 1987, first referred to as the City Council Golf Committee.
 - o In 1988, "Horseworld" (WestWorld) was added.
 - o And in 1992, the Stadium was added and the committee was renamed the TPC/WestWorld/Stadium Subcommittee.
- Examples of items this committee reviews includes, review of WestWorld Master Plan and implementation efforts or review of the city's proposal on sponsorship and naming rights policies.
- Note: The City's Parks and Recreation Commission is a citizen advisory committee that advises the City Council on the acquisition of lands and facilities for use as parks or recreation centers. This Commission also advises on the operation, use, care and maintenance of these parks and recreation areas. The Community Services Department staff manages the Stadium and the TPC contracts, and items relating to these areas could be considered by the Parks & Recreation Commission if there is Council interest to have this council committee focus solely on WestWorld.

(Scotts. Cont.) Subcommittee on Regional Aviation Issues (Formed on 12/9/02)

- This subcommittee typically meets on the 3rd Wednesday at 5:00 p.m. The last meeting was held on May 19, 2004.
- The aviation subcommittee oversees the development and implementation of strategic action plans that the City can undertake to become more involved in aviation, air space and airport facility planning in the region. The goal is to minimize the impact of all aircraft noise from area airports over Scottsdale without impacting the economics of the community.
- Examples of items discussed by this subcommittee have included updates on the Phoenix Airspace Users Working Group or whether or not to recommend the City of Scottsdale join the N.O.I.S.E. group a group of city officials who were working with the League of Cities and Towns to support improved aircraft noise legislation.
- The city also has an Airport Advisory Commission whose purpose is to advise the City Council on matters relating to the operation of the airport, proposals for development, airport area land use, fees and safety concerns.

Ad-Hoc Budget Subcommittee (Formed on 12/9/03)

- This ad-hoc subcommittee gathers public input regarding the Scottsdale city budget and makes recommendations to the full City Council. Previously the Citizen Budget Review Committee fulfilled some of these functions, but was disbanded when the subcommittee formed. The Mayor appoints the ad-hoc committee members each year.
- The 2004 subcommittee held seven public meetings and three citizen forums from January to April 2004. Following their presentation of recommendations to the full Council, the Committee's ad-hoc role sunsets.
- This committee (in addition to budget-related items) reviewed a presentation on sponsorship and naming rights policies. The Budget Subcommittee directed staff to prepare a policy for consideration by the full City Council. This item was brought forward to the full City Council on May 17th, was continued, and brought back and passed by the full City Council on August 30th (6-1).

(Scotts. Cont.)
Former Council
Subcommittees
that have been
discontinued.

- City Court Subcommittee (~ 1990-2002) provided oversight on Court policies.
 The subcommittee ended in 2002, as there were not sufficient items for a
 subcommittee to discuss. The Judicial Appointments Advisory Board
 recommends judicial appointments for the City Court but does not oversee any
 policy matters.
- The Compensation Review subcommittee (~ 1986-2002) was responsible for reviewing the salary and benefits of Charter officials (initially City Manager, City Attorney and City Judge). Two council members were initially appointed to this subcommittee. This subcommittee ended because the responsibility was handled by the full City Council.